Goodyear	City of Goodyear	Meeting Location:
	Meeting Minutes	Goodyear Justice Center 14455 W. Van Buren St., Suite B101
	City Council Work Session	Goodyear, AZ 85338
	Mayor Georgia Lord	
	Vice Mayor Sheri Lauritano	
	Councilmember Joanne Osborne	
	Councilmember Joe Pizzillo	
	Councilmember Wally Campbell	
	Councilmember Bill Stipp	
	Councilmember Sharolyn Hohman	
Monday, April 17, 2017	5:00 PM	Goodyear Justice Center

1 CALL TO ORDER

Mayor Lord called the Work Session to order at 5:02 P.M.

2. ROLL CALL

Present 7 - Mayor Lord, Vice Mayor Lauritano, Councilmember Osborne, Councilmember Pizzillo, Councilmember Campbell, Councilmember Stipp, and Councilmember Hohman

Staff Present: City Manager Brian Dalke, City Attorney Roric Massey, and City Clerk Maureen Scott

3. AGENDA ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION:

3.1 <u>17-6037ws</u> Staff will share recommendations for implementation of an "artist embellished" traffic cabinet beautification program.

Guylene Ozlanski, Arts and Culture Coordinator, presented.

The city of Avondale implemented embellished cabinets. Six were wrapped and six were artist painted cabinets. The twelve cabinets cost \$18,000. Staff researched other cities to find out what type of artwork they were using. Artwork that was applied to the cabinets included painted, wrapped, metalwork screening, masonry, and parasolieil (a metal material consisting of aluminum or steel that is perforated to create a design).

Luke Albert, City Traffic Engineer, reviewed the size of the traffic cabinets. There are 89 intersections with traffic cabinets in Goodyear. There are 6 inch stainless cabinets and 4.6 inch white cabinets. The function of the cabinet is for heat, safety, maintenance and access. There is a ten year replacement plan.

Applied Artwork	Estimated Cost	Life Expectancy
Wrapped Cabinet	\$1,200 - \$1,500	3-5 years
Painted Cabinet	\$2,000 - \$3,000	5-10 years

Metal Wall/Gate	\$4,000 - \$12,000	20+ years
Masonry Wall	\$1,500 - \$5,000	20+
Parasoleil Screen	\$2,000 - \$4,000	10-20 years

Laura Kaino, Arts and Culture Commissioner, reviewed the Arts and Culture Commission recommendations.

*Commission supports beautification project

*Commission supports both wrapped and painted cabinets

*Project Expenditures

>Build capacity in Public Art Fund

>Request additional funding source for project

Staff would like to start out with fifteen cabinets in FY18 and fifteen cabinets in FY19 and work with Council to identify locations.

Council Discussion and Questions:

*No preference to painted cabinets or wraps.

*How many get hit by cars? Albert said it is around one maybe two a year.

*Excellent idea. Doesn't like the block wall though.

*Likes the painting, and would also like to look into the metal work.

*This won't come out of the art budget.

*Would like to see a mixture of metals and painting, which would tie into our medal median art.

*Look at community and corporate areas to decide what type of coverings to use.

*If there are two cabinets, the pretty one will pull attention to the other unpainted cabinet.

*Look for corners that have only one cabinet.

*Not in favor of it. Other towns are having difficulty with accepting art cabinets. The embellishments don't match the neighborhoods.

*If we paint one box, there could be an expectation that all boxes should be painted.

*Would like to do only a couple to see how they are received by the citizens.

*We haven't asked the residents if they want covered boxes.

*Some embellishments are really nice and some are not so nice.

*Agree to only do a couple at first.

*Should create the embellishment to match the area of the cabinets. For example, if a cabinet is near a golf course then it should have something to reflect golfing.

*Adapt to the neighborhoods.

***How do you remove graffiti from the embellished cabinets?** Ozlanski said that on the wrapped cabinets you can add an anti-graffiti guard that sometimes works and sometimes it doesn't work. Anti-graffiti guards can be added to the painted cabinets. The metal work can be sanded in the graffiti areas on the embellishments.

*Would like to have our own stamp on this for Goodyear and have our own branding.

*Pick some neighborhoods to get their ideas and thoughts.

*It is good to start with city-owned properties.

*Look at the intersections and what makes sense.

*Use the Tom Van and take it to the parks and HOA's for feedback.

*Would like to see more examples.

3.2 <u>17-5994ws</u> Staff will provide information on the General Fund-Draft FY18 Budget & general government (non-utility) 10-Year Capital Improvement Program (CIP) projects. The Ballpark, Highway User Revenue (HURF) and other miscellaneous funds will also be addressed. Requests for FY17 to FY18 carryovers will also be provided. In addition, an overview of the citywide budget process will be included in the presentation. Council discussion and feedback on the FY18 draft budget, CIP projects, and proposed carryovers will be requested and used to guide finalizing the Tentative FY18 Budget and 18-27 10-Year Capital Improvement Program.

Lauri Wingenroth, Budget and Research Manager, presented. The budgets are monitored throughout the year. There is a high level review of department expenditures in conjunction with the monthly financial report. The budget is reviewed to actual analysis. Procurement requests of \$2,500 or more are reviewed. Budget transfers are processed to avoid over expenditures.

These are ongoing cost of existing day to day operations. One-time items are not included in the base budget.

Process Overview:

*Budget and Research prepares targets, instructions, and spreadsheets

*Budget and Research performs a technical review

*Meeting with Department, Budget and Research, City Manager's Office

Budget Monitor and Review Results-Examples of Material Findings in Last Two Years *Issues from budgeting and transacting differently

>Excess spending capacity associated with a capital reserve, \$250,000 removed from base budget in FY16

>In lieu property tax payment from utilities to General Fund; \$900,000 in General Fund resources addressed in FY18 Draft Budget

*A one-time expense was recorded as ongoing-\$200,000; removed from base budget in FY17 *No funding plan for Risk Reserve-established target; no General Fund contributions since FY15

*Routine items have been addressed in base budgets

Supplemental Budget Request Process:

*Addition for cost changes such as inflation or growth in accounts, to add new services and related positions. and/or for one-time items.

Process Review

*Budget and Research prepares database and instructions

*Departments prepare requests

*Budget and Research technical review

*Meeting with Department, Budget and Research, and City Manager Office

The supplemental process gives a second chance to see if the request can be absorbed into the

current budget. After review, not all base budget requests are recommended.

Salary and Benefits Costs

*Budget and Research prepares salary and benefit estimates

- >Full-time positions base budget, supplementals, and labor costing
- >Part-time/temporary and overtime estimates reviewed and benefits added

>Methods

*Salaries/Wages

>Based on actual pays

>Market is used for vacant positions

*Benefits

>Known rates for pension, social security, medicare, etc.

>Health and dental based on a weighted average of actual use applied to all positions

*Human Resources develops compensation and benefit recommendations for City Council consideration

Capital Project Process

*Additions or updates to projects generally more than \$50,000 for new facilities and infrastructure or that extend the life of existing assets.

- *10-Year Capital Improvement Plan (CIP)
- >Funded Projects
- >Do not award contract above budget

*Focus areas

>Current year estimate

>Scrutinize and update upcoming fiscal year

- >Add new 10th year
- >Material changes to middle years
- >Other new projects
- *Department and City Council generate ideas
- >New projects and changing priorities
- >Critical repair or maintenance needs
- >Citizen survey results
- *Departments prepare requests

>New database developed in FY17 process

>Costs by phase, scope, justification, operating budget impacts

- *Finance, Engineering and City Manager Office technical review
- >Project scope description
- >Cost estimates reasonable, correct phase, thorough
- >Priority relative to overall goals and direction
- >Timing

Recent Improvements-Capital Project Process

*Inflation had not been consistently applied

>Remains as an issue with impact fee funded projects-many are still under funded in 10-year

- plan-new study will address
- >Costing sheet added for each project to identify common project costs

>Enhanced focus on operating costs

- *Ability to establish future operating cost set-aside
- *Section added to budget document received high ratings

Carryover Request Process

*Re-budget a one-time item such as a consultant contract or construction project that is not completed in the current year. Most are CIP projects.

Process Review

- *Operating requests via database; CIP via spreadsheet
- *Department request explains and justifies

*Reviewed by Budget and Research Division and City Manager's Office

The base budget concept creates a challenge as far as looking at efficiencies within the departments.

Council Discussion and Questions:

*Would like to see LEAN examples of how money was saved. Wingenroth shared some examples of LEAN through Finance and Parks and Recreation. Many departments have seen savings and have been more efficient through the LEAN process.

*Inflation-do we need to address this in the policy? Wingenroth said it should be the administrative side to manage the inflation on projects. Staff has made great strides to manage the inflation costs. She encourages to let staff monitor and prepare for the additional costs.

*Project management timelines are very important.

*Would like to have updates on projects that Council can share with citizens.

Documented timelines would help staff and Council understand where various contracts and projects are at. Need more information to answer citizens questions. Dalke explained that this information is on the city's website. Staff will work on providing Council with more information about project schedules.

Mayor Lord recessed the Work Session at 6:39 p.m.

Mayor Lord reconvened the Work Session at 7:07 p.m.

Council Discussion and Questions:

*When did the MOU's expire? Wingenroth said in FY18

*Council would like to be involved with setting limits before negotiations begin for the **MOU's for Police and Fire**. City Attorney Massey stated that it would be appropriate for Council to set parameters for the negotiations if they want to.

*Recommended positions: Asked about the requests to create new positions. Is there a way to repurpose an already allocated position rather than create a new position? Finance Director Sandstrom stated that staff analyzes all of this and, when it gets to the point that existing staff can no longer absorb the duties, staff makes a recommendation to Council to create a new position. *Right of Way Superintendent-do we need this position when they supervise six people? Nathan Torres, Parks and Recreation Director, explained why this position is needed.

***How many part time positions are we converting to full-time?** Torres said that there are two part time positions that are already receiving benefits.

*Council would like to be informed when a full-time position is eliminated and where that position has been moved to for repurposing. Dalke responded that all repurposed positions are outlined when presented to the Audit Committee in the fall of each year. The cost implications are outlined at that time as well.

*Asked about what happens if the ambulance service contract goes into effect this year. How will we fund the seven positions that are involved? Wingenroth explained that the first six weeks of training is budgeted as one-time costs. We didn't list the full costs because next year the program will have revenue to offset ongoing costs. If the program were to start earlier than anticipated, we would have to find a way to fund the difference between the revenues and the positions. There would also be some additional one-time costs associated with a loss revenue that we wouldn't experience in the first year. Staff doesn't anticipate this program will get started providing services until July, 2018 (FY19).

***When would the fire positions be hired for the ambulance program?** Paul Luizzi, Fire Chief, said that if the ambulance program goes through then the program would be implemented July 2018. Training would begin in early spring 2018.

*Concerned about adding a Project Manager for the fire stations. Rebecca Zook, Engineering Director, said we are unable to start all projects on July 1st. We look at the entire year to see when projects are initiated. We don't want to overburden the project managers. Depending on the projects, project managers can do 4-8 projects a year.

*Is there a way to isolate the one-time money being set aside in the amount of approximately \$62,000 for the seven ambulance service positions so that it doesn't get sucked up into personnel services? Wingenroth responded that she can create a contingency and not move it over to the Fire Department until the item is actually approved by Council, or it could be placed in a Fire Department line item and not allow expenditures against it.

*Suggested creating a separate accounting organization for the ambulance service program.

*Clarified that the budgeted one-time funds can be carried over to the next fiscal year if they aren't used.

Capital Project Process

*Additions or updates to projects generally more than \$50,000 for new facilities and infrastructure or that extend the life of existing assets.

*10-Year Capital Improvement Plan (CIP)

>Funded Projects

>Do not award contract above budget

*Focus areas

>Current year estimate

>Scrutinize and update upcoming fiscal year

>Add new 10th year

>Material changes to middle years

>Other new projects

*Department and City Council generate ideas

>New projects and changing priorities

>Critical repair or maintenance needs

>Citizen survey results

*Departments prepare requests

>New database developed in FY17 process

>Costs by phase, scope, justification, operating budget impacts

*Finance, Engineering and City Manager Office technical review

>Project scope description

>Cost estimates reasonable, correct phase, thorough

>Priority relative to overall goals and direction

>Timing

Recent Improvements-Capital Project Process

*Inflation had not been consistently applied

>Remains as an issue with impact fee funded projects-many are still under funded in 10-year plan-new study will address

>Costing sheet added for each project to identify common project costs

>Enhanced focus on operating costs

*Ability to establish future operating cost set-aside

*Section added to budget document received high ratings

Carryover Request Process

*Re-budget a one-time item such as a consultant contract or construction project that is not completed in the current year. Most are CIP projects.

Process Review

*Operating requests via database; CIP via spreadsheet

*Department request explains and justifies

*Reviewed by Budget and Research Division and City Manager's Office

Wingenroth reviewed other funds with supplementals.

*Arizona Lottery Funds-Restricted to Transit Purposes

>Contract increase on Zoom; \$45,800 ongoing

>Clean-up basin; \$13,000 one-time

*Court Enhancement

>Ongoing \$40,000 for security guard

Requested Carryovers-General, Asset Management, HURF, Ballpark, Grants Funds

*Operating Budget-\$4.3M

>\$1.7M General Fund

*Remaining job credit funds-\$0.9M

*Fleet Asset Management-\$2.1M

>Mostly fire apparatus

*Capital Projects-\$8.2M

>\$6.7M General Fund

*Remaining budget for financial system project-\$1.9M

*Goodyear Blvd. Phase 2-\$1.6M

General Fund FY18 Draft Budget and 10-Year CIP

Included in the Draft Budget

Base Budget Includes:

*Compensation and benefits

>Represented MOU's

>Non-represented as presented on 4/10

*Compensation study-3 or 4% and regarded positions

*3%

>Pensions, benefits, etc.

*Ongoing operations

Contingencies:

*General Fund Contingency

>Change financial policy to 15% of ongoing revenue

>Maintain, grow into FY17 contingency of \$17.8M

*Potential Personnel Services Requirements

>1% MOU provision should FY16 and FY17 revenues meet trigger-\$200,000

>Combine and reduce FMLA/retirement related to \$100,000

Set-Asides and Reserves

*Set-Asides

>Ballpark debt

>Future operating costs

*Asset management reserves for 10-year plans

*Newly proposed Capital Projects reserve

>Upcoming capital projects

>Unanticipated conditions

>Upcoming requirements for loans to impact fee funds

Recommended Supplementals

*Ongoing: \$3.4M; 21 positions

>Fire: 7 non-sworn positions for ambulance program

>Police: 5 officers, 1 sergeant, 1 police assistant, and 2 telecommunication operators

>Other departments

*Development Agreement Coordinator

*Convert part-time to 2 full-time recreation coordinators

*Use city employee instead of contractor for court security

*Right of Way Superintendent

*One-time: \$6.1M

Direct Community Services

*Police squad and police assistant

*Library operating costs and extended hours

*Ambulance program start-up costs

*Sidewalk gap program

*Self-help center at Municipal Court

Deliver Capital Projects and Support Development

*Project Manager services for fire stations projects

*Development agreement coordinator

*Economic Development impact fee reduction program at \$2M for two years

*Temporary positions, overtime, and contracted services for inspections, civil engineering, plan review, design guidelines and landscape ordinance updates, building safety

Recommended Supplementals

*Meet contractual obligations and pay for ongoing operations

>Contract increases for jail and police, state revenue collection, landscape and janitorial services

>Maintenance contracts and software licensing

>Complete projects to update security systems on city buildings and improvements to exhaust systems in fire stations

>Pay for water meters for right of way

*Safety, Training, and Efficiencies

>Court security guard

>Single system for digital evidence

>Replace out dated equipment and systems

>Behavioral health services for sworn fire employees

>Sanitizer for aquatics

Proposed CIP Summary

General Government

*\$8.9M General Fund projects in FY18

*\$37.4M GO Bond funded projects FY17-21

>Includes \$7.5M for Surface Water project

>Estimated GO Bond capacity \$45M

*Impact fee projects in 10 year plan remain underfunded pending FY18 study

*Many impact fee projects require loans

Existing with No Funding Changes

*Bullard and Van Buren Intersection improvements

*Pavement management (inflation added)

*One warranted traffic signal (inflation added)

*Van Buren: Estrella Parkway to Sarival

*Reprogramming only of the existing budget for the financial system replacement

New Projects

*Renovation of the Ziz public art

*Renovations to City Hall and Fire Stations 183 and 187 per Facilities Master Plan

*Renovate existing Fire Station 181

*Further analysis and known repairs to ballpark right field pavilion *Phase 1 off-sites for the 86-acre recreation campus

Existing or Ongoing Projects with Changes

*Matching funds for traffic signal fiber projects

*Riggs Road land acquisitions

*Program public art projects for specific CIP projects and unplanned years at lump sum of \$75,000

Key 10 Year General Fund CIP Changes

*Complete Phase I off-sites and public art projects for Recreation Campus

*Fund \$1.8M a year for pavement manage

*Fund one warranted traffic signal each year

*Complete Fire Station 183 and City Hall improvements

*One project moved to asset management

Council Discussion and Questions:

*Fire Station 183 renovations. Javier Setovich, Public Works Director, said it would cost almost \$900,000 to renovate Fire Station 183. The fire station was built in 2000.

*Need to know what the \$900,000 is covering when renovating the fire station.

***Would like a list that outlines what each station needs.** Dalke said that staff would share the specific information with Council.

*There may be some wants and not needs in the fire station requests. There may be more important places to use the money. Will need more information as to what is needed to update the fire stations.

*Suggested doing an inventory on the fire station and see what needs to be done. Possibly do some this year and some next year.

*Can we buy a new trailer instead of renovating the old trailer in Mobile for \$40,000? Luizzi said that we don't own the land that the trailer sits on.

*Suggested taking another asset tour so Council can visualize the priorities.

***Public Art Fund - What does a \$185,000 public art project look like?** Torres said the public art will be highly interactive and help bring our community together. It won't be a statue. ***Recommend to push West Goodyear Fire Station back to 2021. Despite the call volume being there, the number of back up resources for the West Goodyear area far exceeds EMR. This would free up General Fund and staff capacity.** Chief Luizzi said call volume has increased.

*Why wouldn't we want to leave West Goodyear Fire Station in FY19/20? We are approving a ten year CIP. There is always a chance that next year it could be forgotten. *What is happening to the response time in West Goodyear? Chief Luizzi said response times are a little bit higher around 5 minutes and 30 seconds.

*We need to leave the West Goodyear fire station in the CIP. Consensus to keep it in FY19/20.

***What do the City Hall renovations for \$156,000 include?** Setovich said there are space challenges at City Hall.

*The energy is gone out of City Hall since APS left. Suggested adding music to the lobby.

It needs to be updated.

*Security improvements at GMC Courts is not funded. Wingenroth said the security guard has been funded. We would have to look at removing other items in the CIP in order to fund this.

*Court Security Standards are not being met, so how can we not fund the security improvements? Crystal McCreery, Court Administrator, reviewed the timeline standards for the new security improvements. The sally port falls at the end of the implementation. Funding the sally port at a later date will still keep the Court in compliance with the new security standards.

***How many people do we generally have in custody during a week?** McCreery responded that we have between 6 and 12 per week. We transport them in a van.

*Frustrated with the process of prioritizing items in the CIP. A year ago we were looking at traffic signals. Wingenroth said the CIP is programmed to add one warranted traffic signal every year. Council can change that.

*If we don't need a traffic signal this year, why can't we use the money for courts? Engineering Director Rebecca Zook stated that it was her understanding that staff will monitor signals and present Council with their needs in the fall before budget season begins. They cannot install a signal unless it is warranted.

Mayor Lord recessed the Work Session at 9:55 p.m.

Mayor Lord reconvened the Work Session at 10:01 p.m.

FY18 Draft Budget-Ongoing Financial Summary Beginning Fund Balance \$36M Revenues \$89.3M Set-Asides PIC (\$2.1M) Future Operating Costs (\$1.0M) Transfers in \$4.7M Total Resources \$93.5M

Base Budget \$75.1M Supplementals \$3.4M Debt Service (includes Ballpark) \$8.1M Transfers Out \$8.1M

HURF \$0.7 Ballpark \$2.5M Used for One-Time Purposes \$3.7M Total Uses \$93.5M

FY18 Property Tax Rate: Primary (General Fund Ongoing) - 1.1344 Secondary (GO Bond Debt Service) - 0.6005 Total: 1.7349

Other Items for Consideration:

*Pickleball Court - \$168,000

*Softball Fields:

- Convert existing - \$107,000

- Install new - \$243,000

*Monument signs - \$75,000 for two locations

*Clinic relocation - \$51,000

Council Discussion and Questions:

*Still has questions about possibly adding Community Paramedicine.

*Do we need to look at adding something for both Police and Fire behavior health?

*Citizen input indicates they want pickleball courts and softball fields.

*Sees value in public art.

*Monthly InFocus magazine is a great marketing tool and important to our citizens. *The street widening at Sarival Avenue and Yuma Road is an ongoing issue. Is there a way to switch the Sarival Avenue/Jefferson Street toYuma Road expansion from FY 2019/20 with the McDowell Road/Citrus Road CIP item. Wingenroth said that all of the impact fee projects are under funded because inflation wasn't included. The total projects required additional general funds. The two projects cannot be switched because one is in the north impact fee area and the other is in the south impact fee area.

*We are doing everything right for our employees.

*Looking for ways to handle growth.

**In favor of the Economic Development incentives, but maybe consider \$1M instead of \$2M.

*Would like to lower the grocery food tax.

*Doesn't have a problem with Surface Water Treatment Plant project. I only question using property taxes as a way of funding because that means we are taxing people that are outside the service area.

*In favor of increasing funding for InFocus.

*When need to really at what our citizens want such as pickle ball and softball. We just need to make sure that we cover both the north and south sides of the freeway.

*In favor of the \$2M Economic Development incentives.

*In favor of 10 issues of InFocus.

*Wants Community Paramedicine to be a priority as we move forward. We don't want to forget about this program.

*Would like to finish Phase II of the Police Administration Building and get all of our officers under one roof sooner than later.

*Agrees with adding more pickelball ball courts. Horseshoe pits are also very popular. Dalke said that horseshoes have recently been added at Loma Linda park.

*Would like 12 months for the InFocus.

*Questioned the proposed improvements for the Indians Development Complex facilities at the Ballpark. Finance Director Doug Sandstrom said that this is handled through the Public Improvement Corporation (PIC) process. This won't actually be costing the city anything but we need to show this as an expense because the monies will actually be filtered through us. The legal documents will show that they are covering 100% of the costs. This will be brought to Council for approval on May 8th. We are borrowing the money for them.

*Would like the Indians to commit to a five-year contract extension as part of the deal before signing any paperwork. The Indians can get cheaper interest rates by using the PIC financing option through us. Dalke said the Indians have just finished their ninth year of a 20-year lease agreement. If we use our PIC financing, there would be an additional five-year option, which would extend the lease to 25 years. The Indians are still looking at obtaining shorter term financing, so these talks are still ongoing. We will have more information on May 8th Council Meeting.

*There is a benefit to the city. Dalke said the Indians are investing in a 16,000 square foot expansion. They are looking at having more year-round use of the complex.for both minor and major leagues.

***Do other cities fund ballparks this way?** Dalke said that it is generally left to the cities to construct their own renovations to keep the teams in their city long term.

*In support of installing a new softball field in Estrella instead of converting a baseball field.

*In favor of adding the two monument signs.

*We need 12 months of InFocus.

*We have set aside \$3.7M of unattached money for future needs. Recommend that we use this \$3.7M to advance the Sarival Road and Yuma street widening project. *Believes in tourism and adding attractions to the city.

Dalke reviewed Council consensus for funding:

*Pickelball courts - \$168,000.

*Softball field - install new field at the Estrella Foothills Park. We will also be adding significant park improvements in central Goodyear.

*Continue with two monument signs.

*Employee Health Clinic relocation - there will be a parking issue when the assisted living facility opens. We could put the clinic in another city facility.

*InFocus for 12 issues.

*Community Paramedicine -possibly use grant funding. There needs to be an appropriation for it to process grant funding coming back in.

*Sarival and Yuma road widening project. Staff will look at what capability we have to fund it *Check whether additional funds are needed to fund Police Department behavioral health along with the Fire Department behavioral health.

*Economic Development two-year incentive program - \$2M.

4. INFORMATION ITEMS

None.

5. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to discuss, Mayor Lord adjourned the Work Session at 10:53

p.m.

Maureen Scott, City Clerk

Georgia Lord, Mayor

Date: _____